



ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7
Software Engineering
Secretariat: CANADA (SCC)

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7 N1524
June 17, 1996

DOC TYPE: **Disposition of Comment Report**

TITLE: **Disposition of Comments Contained in JTC1 N3588, Summary of Voting on Document JTC1 N 3377, DTR 14399: Information Technology - Mapping of Relevant Software Engineering Standards - Standards Relevant to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7 - Software Engineering**

SOURCE: **Project Editor: Tomoo Matsubara**

PROJECT: **7.20.03.01: Mapping of Relevant SE Standards - Standards Relevant to Software Engineering**

STATUS: **DTR**

REFERENCES: **ISO/IEC JTC1 N 3377 (DTR 14399), ISO/IEC JTC1 N 3588 (Summary of Voting)**

ACTION ID: **FYI or ACT. The DTR will be submitted to ITTF for TR processing. When published, this TR will be maintained by the SC7 Secretariat (Resolution 314 of Ottawa Plenary)**

DUE DATE:

DISTRIBUTION: **Electronic: SC7_AG and ITTF; Disk: P, O and L**

MEDIUM: **E-Mail - uuencoded Word ; Diskette - Word**

NO. OF PAGES: **8**

DISK: **7**

Disposition of Comments on ISO/IEC JTC 1 N3588

"P" member

Australia (Approve)

Austria (Approve)

Belgium (Approve & Disapprove? Comments not received)

Brazil (Approve)

Canada (Approve)

China (Not voting)

Czech Republic (Approve)

Denmark (Approve)

Egypt (Approve)

Finland (Approve)

France (Not voting)

Germany (Approve with comments)

No.	Disposition mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
General	Deferred		It would be better to publish as a Standing Document (SD)	See Resolution 314 of Ottawa Plenary
1	Accepted	Introduction	Para 2: Delete Work Item Number.	Deleted
2	Accepted	Introduction	Para 3: Delete sentence 2 and 3.	Deleted
3	Accepted	Introduction	Penultimate sentence: Replace "work done by JTC1/SC7/WG5" with "work done within ISO/IEC JTC1".	Replaced
4	Accepted	Introduction	Para 4 and 5: It is too detail if this document is really approved for publication as an ISO TR	?????
5	Accepted	1. Scope	Para 1: A Scope cannot be standards.	Corrected
6	Accepted	1. Scope	Para 3, line 3: Replace words.	Replaced

7	Accepted	1. Scope	Para 3, line 4: Replace "standards" with "standards" .	Replaced
8	Accepted	1. Scope	Para 5: Restructure 2nd sentence.	Restructured
9	Accepted	3. Abbr.	Try rewriting text ...	Rewritten
10	Accepted	4.1	Para 1, 2 and 3: Try rewriting...	Rewritten
11	Accepted	4.1	Para 4 is not clear.	Rewritten based on UK comment.
12	Partially accepted	4.2.1.4	Use the organizations conventions when listing parts of a multi-part document and year of publication.	Reviewed and corrected when reliable sources available.
13	Partially accepted	4	Quote organization's catalogue	Quoted when reliable sources available.
14	Accepted	4.2.1.3	Insert IEC before each number	Corrected
15	Accepted	4.2.1.5	Check prefixes. Some standards were published before JTC1 was formed.	Checked by formal catalogue and corrected
16	Partially accepted	4.2.1.5	Replace project number with CD, WD or SC document number.	Added CD and WD number but not with SC.
17	Rejected	4.2.1.5	NP should not include.	Even a part of NPs are disapproved they are useful for reference.
18	Rejected	4.2.3.2	ISO/IEC guides have not been developed or published by AFNOR.	These items took from French comments. They can not remove without request from French member body.
19	Accepted	4.2.3.3	Different items have same numbers.	Checked and corrected.
20	Accepted	4.2.3.5, 4.2.3.6	Items are duplicated.	Checked and corrected.
<u>21</u>	Accepted	4.2.3.8	Canada's standards have other prefixed.	Checked and corrected.
22	Accepted	4.2.3.11	Supply full title.	Appended
23	Rejected	4.2.3.12	Check two underdevelopment standards.	They are IRS's direct contribution. No need to check further.
24	Accepted	4.2.3.18	Replace "Scotland" with "Scotland".	Corrected
25	Accepted	4.2.3.22	Replace "STRITSE" with "STRITS2".	Corrected
26	Accepted	4.2.4	Indicate country of origin in brackets before the colon.	Indicated
27	Accepted	4.2.4.6	Replace KBST with KBSI.	Corrected
28	Accepted	4.2.4.6	Replace "V-Model" with "Vorgehensmodell".	Replaced
29	Accepted	4.2.4.14	Correct department name.	Corrected

30	Accepted	4.2.4.15	Correct department name.	
31	Accepted	4.2.4.16	Correct department name.	Corrected
32	Accepted	4.2.6.7	Correct organization name.	Corrected.
33	Deferred	4.2.7.2	Append country and title of DISA.	To be investigated.
34	Accepted	4.2.7.3	Append and move to 4.2.4.	Appended and moved.
35	Accepted	4.2.7.4	Insert country.	Inserted
36	Accepted	5. GISA	Append English name.	Appended
37	Accepted	5	Corrections to 4.2 be implemented in clause 5.	Implemented
38	Accepted	4.2.2.2	Correct title.	Corrected

Hungary (Approved)

India (Not voting)

Ireland (Approved)

Italy (Approved)

Japan (Approve with comments)

No.	Disposition mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
1	Accepted	4.2.3.13	5 standards are not included.	Included
2	Accepted	4.2.3.13	3 work in progress standards are not included.	Included
3	Accepted	4.2.3.13	No corresponding ISO number.	Appended
4	Deferred	General	SC7 secretariat should accept the responsibility to maintain this TR.	See Resolution 314 of Ottawa Plenary

Korea, Republic of (Approved)

Mongolia (Approved)

Netherlands (Approved with comments)

No.	Disposi- mark	Section		Disposition
1		4.2.1.4	4.2.1.4 is not up to date.	

New Zealand (Not voting)

Norway (Approved)

Romania (Approved)

Russian Federation. (Not voting)

South Africa (Not voting)

Slovenia (Approved with comments)

No.	Disposi- tion mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
1	Accepted	After 4.2.3.21	4 work in progress standards should be added.	Added
2	Accepted	5	SMIS should be inserted.	Inserted

Sweden (Approved)

Switzerland (Approved)

United Kingdom (Approved with comments)

Annex A

No.	Disposition mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
A1	Deferred		It should include detail of some feedback mechanism.	Maintenance responsibility will be done by secretariat. See Resolution 314 of Ottawa Plenary
A2	Partially accepted		Include year of publication.	Included if contributed or easily accessible materials show year of publication.
A3	Accepted	Title	Replace the title.	Replaced
A4	Accepted	Intro.	Replace a word.	Corrected
A5	Rejected	1	Delete the final paragraph.	Rewritten by German comment.
A6	Accepted	3	Replace final paragraph.	Replaced
A7	Accepted	4.1	Replace (where used) the term "standard items" with "items".	Replaced
A8	Accepted	4.1	Replace the final paragraph.	Replaced
A9	Accepted	4.2.1.3	"Application of Markov Techniques" move from "work in progress" to "standard".	Moved to "standard".
A10	Accepted	4.2.2.4	Delete 2 standards, add 12 standards.	Deleted and added.
A11	Accepted	4.2.2.5	Replace 2 standards, add 1 standard.	Replaced and added.
A12	Accepted	4.2.3.6	Correction	Corrected
A13	Accepted	4.2.4.8	Corrections	Corrected
A14	Accepted	4.2.3.18	Correction	Corrected

Annex B

No.	Disposition mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
B1			Same as A1	
B2			Same as A2	
B3	Reject	General	Categorization	It will consume enormous amount of efforts for investigation. It is subject to future update.
B4	Rejected	General	Refer to the base standard with multiple numbers in different countries.	It is depends on description in the contributed documents.
B5			Same as A4	
B6	Accepted	1, para 3	Use the term "official" instead of "de jure".	Changed
B7	Accepted	1, para 4	Use the term "unofficial" instead of "de facto".	Changed
B8	Resolved	1, para 5	Reword 5th para.	Reworded based on German comment.
B9			Same as A6	
B10			Same as A8	
B11	Deferred	4.2.1.3	On IEC 65A(Secretariat)90, BS EN 61131-3, 1069-7, 65A(Secretariat)123, 65A(Secretariat)307, and 56(Secretariat)349.	Currently no materials to confirm correctness.
B12	Accepted	4.2.1.5	Are WI number and title correct?	Corrected based on secretariat's report.
B13	Deferred	4.2.2.1	There is a later draft of CEN/TC 114N, namely pr EN 945-1, 1994.	Not found in current catalogue.
B14			Same as A11	
B15	Accepted	4.2.3.6	On BS 5760	Checked and corrected referring catalogue.
B16	Accepted	4.2.4.1	MIL-STD-882B is now at MIL-STD-882C.	Updated
B17	Accepted	4.2.5.9	Title changed.	Updated
B18	Deferred	4.2.7.3	Publisher of ITSEC 1.2 is Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, not GISA.	Need to confirm published organization.
B19	Accepted	4.2.1.3 4.2.1.5	Two items should be included.	Included
B20	Deferred	4.2.2.1	There are other drafts.	To be confirmed
B21	Deferred	4.2.3.2	There is an ISO/AFNOR dictionary.	To be confirmed
B22	Deferred	4.2.3.9	Perhaps DIN V19 250 should be included.	There is no German comment. To be confirmed.
B23	Deferred	4.2.4.3	There is an FAA "Digital Systems Validation Handbook".	There is no US comment. To be confirmed.

B24	Deferred	4.2.4.8	There should be an entry under work in progress for DEF STAN 00-58 on application of HAZOP to software analysis.	Full title need to be checked.
B25	Deferred	4.2.4, 4.2.5 and 4.2.6	Standards of five organization (IGE, RIA, EEMUA, DRIVE AND MISRA) should be included.	Lack of information for organizations and standards.
B26	Deferred		There are several security standards which may be relevant and should perhaps be included.	Lack of information for organizations and standards.

USA (Approved with comments)

No.	Disposition mark	Section	Comments	Disposition
1	Accepted	4.2.3.3	After the Clause title, add the sentence.	Added
2	Accepted	4.2.4	All sub clauses should indicate the country.	Included