



ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7
Software & System Engineering
Secretariat: CANADA (SCC)

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7 N2528

2001-07-24

Doc. Type	Comment Disposition Report
Title	Comment Disposition Report on 12207/FPDAM 1.2 - Software Engineering - Life Cycle Processes.
Source	JTC1/SC7/WG7 Editor
Project	07.21.01
Status	Final
References	N2490
Action ID	FYI or ACT
Due Date	
Mailing Date	2001-07-24
Distribution	SC7_AG
Medium	Encoded Acrobat
No. Of Pages	18
Note	

Document type Comment disposition report

Title ISO/IEC 12207:1995 FPDAM - Comment disposition for SC 7 N2413

Source ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 7/WG 7 Convener

Status Final

Reference ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 7 N2413

Action ID FYI or ACT

Ballot document information

Project: 07.21.1
Document title: Software life cycle processes - Amendment
WG document code: N0421
SC7 document code: N2413
JTC1 document code:
ISO/IEC document code: ISO/IEC 12207
Document status: FPDAM

Comments: 181

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
AUS-1	TH			A number of problems were identified with the process definitions in the amendment at the meeting of WG 10 in March 2001. These addressed mainly the coherence and accuracy of the outcomes of the various processes, with some concerns regarding 'level 1 capability'. Australia recommends that these issues are addressed fully and completely by WG 7 before progressing the document further."		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
DEU-1	E			Too many fonts used. Finalize on sans-serif (not Roman) throughout		R	Fonts determined by the template
DEU-2	E			When deleting sub-clauses or numbered indentions, remaining texts in lists must be revised for both numbering and layout		A	
DEU-3	E			Referenced documents must be listed in ascending order of number		A	
DEU-4	E			Annex F: There is no consistent layout or line spacing(e.g. before "Outcomes"). There are mixed font types (e.g. F.1.1 Purpose and Outcomes). There are "hanging paragraphs" at beginning of Annex F. Suggestion: Insert "F.0 General" at start.		A	
DEU-5	E			F.3.2, final bullet: switch off blocking-formatting (delete ridiculous blank)		A	
DEU-6	E			Annex G. Clause numbers are totally incorrect (e.g. 6.9, 6.9.1 etc, 7.1, etc)Font types are inconsistent (e.g. Compare 7.4.2 and 7.4.3 "This activity ...")		R	Annex G is number to be consistent with ISO/IEC 12207:1995
DEU-7	E			Annex G: Clause 7.7.1, 7.7.2, 7.7.3, etc, eject to new line after the boldface title for clarity in reading.		A	
DEU-8	E			Annex H has hanging paragraphs (see ISO Directives Part 3: 5.2.4). Insert number and title at beginning		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
FRA-1	TL	Clause 3		There is redundancy between "achievable" and "achievement" in the definition of Process Outcome. Delete achievable or replace achievable with Observable		A	
FRA-2	TL	Clause 4		"The PRM is applicable to an organization that is assessing processes needed for business success and the subsequent continuous improvement of these processes".		A	
FRA-3	TH	Annexe E	1 para 3	It is inappropriate to put the practices, activities and outcomes at the same level. Furthermore, the ter "practices" is not clearly defined and should not have precedence on the termes activities and task		AIP	See W10-3
FRA-4	TL	Annexe F	para 3	Insert diagram similar to figure 1 in ISO/IEC TR 15504-2 to show the relationships between the processes.	Insert diagram	A	
FRA-5	TL	F 1.1.1		Add a sentence in the introduction to the effect that the numbering of outcomes is for identification only and should not be seen as implying priority or sequence.		A	
FRA-6	TL	F1.1.2		Replace "implementation": this word is not context-free and may be seen as implying merely software construction. See also		A	
FRA-7	TL	F1.1.2		"Project" does not adequately represent the range of activities that may be covered by this subclause. Replace with "delivery of the requirements of the project or work product"		A	
FRA-8	TL	F1.1.2		Replace "is" with "is to be" to denote future.		A	
FRA-9	TL	F1.1.2	bullet 2	Revise outcome to give more focus on capability determination.		A	
FRA-10	TL	F1.1.3		Replace "requirements" in the purpose statement with "contract requirements"		R	Agreement includes contracts
FRA-11	TL	F1.1.4		Replace conditions with criteria if the same meaning is intended as in bullet 2 in the same subsection.		A	
FRA-12	TL	F1.3.2	bullet 3	Replace "items" with "elements"		A	
FRA-13	TL	F1.3.2	bullet 7	Change bullet 7 to include consistency AND traceability. Resulting of taking account of F 1.3.2 bullet 7		A	
FRA-14	TL	F1.3.2		Consider bullets 3 and 7 to disambiguate and clarify. Bullet 3 asks that "requirements		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
				allocated to the items of the system" be traceable. However, requirements may not be allocated to system elements until after the architectural design phase. Suggest moving bullet 3 to F1.3.3.			
FRA-15	TL	F1.3.2		Add consideration of prioritization of requirements as an outcome. Already in outcome 1 of F 1.3.2		R	See comment FRA-14
FRA-16	TL	F1.3.3		Allocation of requirements to releases is not part of the system architecture design		A	
FRA-17	TL	F1.3.3	bullet 2	Replace "satisfied" with "addressed"		A	
FRA-18	TL	F1.3.3	bullet 2	Replace "performance requirements" with "non-functional requirements". Also consider under System Requirements Analysis.		A	
FRA-19	TL	F1.3.3	bullet 5	Replace with "verification between the system architecture and the system requirements is performed"		A	
FRA-20	TL	F1.3.4	bullet 1	The question of interface between soft component is premature at software requirement analysis stage		OBE	See W10-20
FRA-21	TL	F1.3.4	bullet 4	Replace outcome 4 with "Consistency and traceability are established between the software requirements and the system requirements baseline".		A	
FRA-22	TL	F1.3.4	bullet 7	Release strategy is important but part of the management priority process and has not to be analysed in software requirement analysis		A	
FRA-23	TL	F1.3.5	bullet 3	Delete "verified" as it has connotations of Level 2 capability.		A	
FRA-24	TL	F1.3.5	bullet 4	Replace "consistency" with "consistency and traceability"		A	
FRA-25	TL			The verification is essential to check if the soft purpose properly reflect the software design		A	
FRA-26	TL	F1.3.6	bullet 3	Add "and traceability" after "consistency"		A	
FRA-27	TL	F1.3.7	purpose	Replace "and to verify the performance and functionality of the software on an equivalent or complete operational platform" with "that are demonstrated to meet the functional and non-functional requirements of the software on an equivalent or complete operational		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
FRA-28	TL	F1.3.7	bullet 1	Replace "with the release strategy" by "with the soft architecture"		A	
FRA-29	TL	F1.3.7	bullet 6	Replace "consistency" with "consistency and traceability is established between software architectural design and..."		A	
FRA-30	TL	F1.3.7	bullets 7	Replace "when a change in software units occurs" by "when a change in software design units occurs"		A	
FRA-31	TH	F1.3.7	bullets 1, 6, 7	Integration purpose wich should only cover element of software design including architecture		A	
FRA-32	TL	F1.3.8	bullet 1	Delete "acceptance"		A	
FRA-33	TL	F1.3.8		Add a new outcome based on the first outcome from TR15504-2 "Criteria for the integrated software will be developed that demonstrate criteria with the software requirements"		A	
FRA-34	TL	F 1.3.9	purpose	Delete "software items and to integrate the software with" with "other system elements, including other software items"		A	
FRA-35	TL	F1.3.9	bullet 1	see comment # 22		A	
FRA-36	TL	F1.3.9	bullet 2	Delete "acceptance"		A	
FRA-37	TL	F1.3.9	bullet 5	Delete "and validation that a complete set of useable deliverable components exists"		A	
FRA-38	TL	F1.3.9	bullet 5	Replace "system requirements" with "System Architectural design" and delete parenthesis		A	
FRA-39	TL	F1.3.9	bullet 2	Include a reference to system interfaces in outcome 2. Replace "aggregate" with "aggregate and interfaces between system elements"		A	
FRA-40	TL	F1.3.10	bullet 1	Replace "acceptance" by "user"		R	See W10-39
FRA-41	TL	F1.3.10	bullet 1	Add a rephrased outcome based on the first outcome from TR15504-2 "Criteria for the integrated software will be developed that demonstrate criteria with the software requirements"		A	
FRA-42	TL	F1.3.11	bullet 3	Replace with outcomes covering the development of installation test criteria and verification against these. Delete reference to "assurance"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
FRA-43	TL	F1.4	bullet 1	Replace "evaluated" with "identified and evaluated"		A	
FRA-44	TL	F1.4.1		Replace with outcomes covering the development of installation test criteria and verification against these. Delete reference to "assurance"		A	
FRA-45	TL	F1.4.2	Purpose	Replace first sentence with: "The purpose of Customer Support is to establish and maintain an acceptable level of service to the customer through assistance and consultation to support the effective use of the product" and delete the second sentence.		A	
FRA-46	TL	F1.4.2	bullet 3	Reverse the order of the phrases to read "customer enquiries and requests and handling operational problems"		A	
FRA-47	TL	F1.4.2	bullet 4	Rephrase "Customer needs" to "Customer Support needs"		A	
FRA-48	TL	F1.5	Purpose	Replace first sentence with: "The purpose of the System and Software maintenance process is to modify a system or component after delivery to correct observed deffects and failures, improve performance or other attributes, or adapt to a changed environment"		A	
FRA-49	TL	F1.5	bullet 2	Replace "is defined" with "are identified"		A	
FRA-50	TL	F1.5	bullet 3	Replace whole bullet with "Affected documentation is updated as need"		A	
FRA-51	TL	F1.5	bullet 7	Replace "software" with "software or		A	
FRA-52	TL	F2.1	bullet 5	Remove "for viewing"		A	
FRA-53	TL	F2.1	bullet 6	Replace "specified" with "defined"		A	
FRA-54	TL	F2.2	bullet 4	Change to "Modifications and releases of the items and elements are made available to concerned parties"		A	
FRA-55	TL	F2.3	bullet 3	Replace "identified" with "identified and recorded"		A	
FRA-56	TL	F2.4	bullet 4	Rephrase to "defects are identified and recorded"		A	
FRA-57	TL	F2.5	bullet 4	Rephrase to "Problems are identified and recorded"		A	
FRA-58	TL	F2.6	purpose	Change "with the customer" to "with the stakeholders"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
FRA-59	TL	F2.6	bullet 1	Rephrase to "Reviews are held at defined milestones and when deemed necessary"		A	
FRA-60	TL	F2.6	bullet 5	Replace "resolved" with "reported"		A	
FRA-61	TL	F2.7	bullet 2	Delete outcome (redundant, see bullet 4)		A	
FRA-62	TL	F2.7	bullet 4	Replace "arranged" with "performed"		A	
FRA-63	TL	F2.7	bullet 5	Delete "and resolved"		A	
FRA-64	TL	F2.8	bullet 1	Replace outcome with "A problem resolution strategy is developed and implemented to ensure that all discovered problems are analysed and resolved"		A	
FRA-65	TL	F2.9	purpose	Replace "individuals and/or groups that will work with the system" with "stakeholders"		A	
FRA-66	TL	F2.10	bullet 3	Replace "specified" with "defined"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
GBR-1	TL	F.2.9	item 1)	Add to item 1 of the outcomes	1. the system meets the needs of users and takes account of their human capabilities and skill limitations;	A	
GBR-2	E	F.2.9		Incorporate output from SWG on usability	Text editorial suggestions to be provided by Jonathan Earthy during plenary	A	
GBR-3	E	F.3.1.3		delete the before purpose statement	The purpose of Quality management	A	
GBR-4	E	F3.1.1		Organization Management is capitalized whereas others in this section are not	use consistent style throughout	A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
SWE-1	G			Until the existing incompatibilities between 12207 and the reference model of 15504 are resolved, Sweden feels it is premature to make radical changes to 12207 as indicated in PDAM1. Such changes to 12207 at this time would lead to confusion and unnecessary complexity for 12207 users.		R	The changes being incorporated into the Amendment are in accordance with the Project Requirements. Both standards are coordinated to be released during the same period of time.
SWE-2	TH	1.1.2	1.4.1	The alternative form given in Annex F is not acceptable		R	No recommended text provided
SWE-3	TH	1.1.2	4.2	The alternative form given in Annex F is not acceptable		R	No recommended text provided
SWE-4	Th	1.1.2	6.3.4.1	The text ...as specified in the contract, should still be utilized		R	ISO 9001 is not a contractual document and a process standard should not impose another standard

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
USA-1	TL	F.1.3.5	Outcomes, #1	Delete the words, "major." All components must be described, not just the major components.	1. A software architectural design shall be developed that describes software components	A	
USA-2	E	F.1.3.9	Purpose statement	Delete "d" from word "integrated."	... with other software items, and to integrate the software ...	A	
USA-3	TH	F.1.3.9	Outcomes, #7	The execution of this activity must result in retesting. Add an outcome for the retesting.	a regression strategy is developed and applied for retesting the system when changes are	A	
USA-4	TH	F.1.4.1	Outcomes, #3	Delete "customer needs" and replace with "agreed requirements." Customer needs cannot be evaluated unless they have been definitized in contracted requirements.	3. ... adequate to meet agreed requirements.	A	
USA-5	TL	F.1.4.2	Purpose statement	Replace "requested" with "agreed." Supplier must be on contract to support this work, or as part of the overall development contract. This cannot be left as open ended as "as requested."	... is provided as agreed to support the use...	OBE	The second sentence of the "purpose" was deleted per WG 10 comment 44, provision for "the agreement" was addressed in Outcome 3 of 1.4
USA-6	E	F.1.5	Outcomes, #4	Delete words, "are not" and replace with "were not."		OBE	The sentence was revised in accordance with SWG3 N0420, that instructs that "An outcome shall be phrased as a declarative sentence using a verb in the present tense." The sentence had the verb "will not", which was changed to "are not" IAW SWG3.
USA-7	TH	F.2.3	Outcomes, 3	Rewrite this outcome to change the "or" to "and".	3. Problems and non-conformances with ...	A	
USA-8	TL	Annex D	D.2	Missing reference	IEEE 1571 is not listed even though it is in Annex E, Table E.1.	A	
USA-9	TL	Annex D	D.2	Incorrect Reference	ISO/IEC 15504-2 has different titles in Annex D and Annex H. Use correct reference titles at time of publication.	A	
USA-10	TL	Annex F	F.1.1 Outcomes	Sometimes delivered products have open items. This should be addressed.	Add: 6. Any identified liens or shortcomings have a satisfactory conclusion as agreed to by customer and supplier.	A	
USA-11	TL	Annex F	F.1.3.2 System requirements analysis	Requirements changes can have significant impacts on the project development	Add: 9. Changes to baselines are evaluated for cost, schedule and technical impact	A	
USA-12	TL	Annex F	F.1.3.3 System architectural design	Design Documents are baselined as well as requirements documents	Add: baselining of the System architectural design	A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
USA-13	TL	Annex F	F.1.3.5 Software design	Design Documents are baselined as well as requirements documents	Add: baselining of the Software design	A	
USA-14	TL	Annex F	F.1.3.4 Software requirements analysis	Requirements changes can have significant impacts on the project development	Add: 8. Changes to baselines are evaluated for cost, schedule and technical impact	A	
USA-15	TL	Annex F	F.1.3.6 Software construction	Software units should also be verified against requirements	Change outcome 4: 4. verification of the software units against the requirements and design is accomplished.	A	
USA-16	TH	Annex F	F.1.4 Operation Process	Operation Process should be agreed upon by the customer	Change outcome 3: 3. assistance and consultation is provided to the customers of the software product in accordance with an agreement between the supplier and customer.	A	
USA-17	TH	Annex F	F.2.8 Problem Resolution Process	Problem Resolution Process should also address defect prevention	Add 5.: 5. A mechanism is provided for recognizing root causes and implementing defect prevention.	A	
USA-18	TH	Annex F	F.3.6 Reuse Program Management Process Outcomes:	Inappropriate use of reuse products can have dire consequences.	10. evaluate reuse proposals to ensure the reuse product is suitable for the proposed application	A	
USA-19	TH	Annex G	7.4 Human Resource Management Process	This should be reflected in Annex F Section F.3.3	Include a description of Annex G purpose in beginning of Annex G and ensure F 3.3 and G 7.4 are in agreement.	A	
USA-20	TH	Annex H	H.1.7 Project Requirements Outcomes	Unclear rights on use of the product and misunderstandings of the support and maintenance agreements are a continuing problem.	Add Outcomes 8 and 9: 8. rights for use and distribution of the product by the customer and supplier will be defined 9. support and maintenance requirements will be established	A	
USA-21	TH	Annex H	H.1.9 Supplier Qualification	Some suppliers may need to correct their processes to be eligible	Add Outcome 5: 5. corrective actions required by the supplier will be identified and corrected	A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
W10-1	TL	Clause 3		There is redundancy between "achievable" and "achievement" in the definition of Process Outcome. Delete achievable or replace achievable with Observable.		A	
W10-2	TL	Clause 4		"The PRM is applicable to an organization that is assessing processes needed for business success and the subsequent continuous improvement of these processes".	Redraft to improve understanding.	A	
W10-3	TL	Annex E 1 para3.		"These Performed tasks, activities and practices" Remove activities and tasks, leaving the generic term practices.		A	
W10-4	TL	Annex F Para 3		Insert diagram similar to figure 1 in ISO/IEC TR 15504-2 to show the relationships between the processes.		A	
W10-5	TL	F1.1.1		Add a sentence in the introduction to the effect that the numbering of outcomes is for identification only and should not be seen as implying priority or sequence.		A	
W10-6	TL	F1.1.2		Replace "implementation": this word is not context-free and may be seen as implying merely software construction. See also		A	
W10-7	TL	F1.1.2		"Project" does not adequately represent the range of activities that may be covered by this subclause. Replace with "delivery of the requirements of the project or work product"		A	
W10-8	TL	F1.1.2		Replace "is" with "is to be" to denote future.		A	
W10-9	TL	F1.1.2 bullet 2		Revise outcome to give more focus on capability determination. JH and PR to redraft.		A	
W10-10	TL	F1.1.3		Replace "requirements" in the purpose statement with "contract requirements"		R	Agreement includes "contract"
W10-11	TL	F1.1.4		Replace conditions with criteria if the same meaning is intended as in bullet 2 in the same subsection.		A	
W10-12	TL	F1.3.2 bullet 3		Replace "items" with "elements"		A	
W10-13	TL	F1.3.2 bullet 7		Change bullet 7 to include consistency AND traceability.		A	
W10-14	TL	F1.3.2		Consider bullets 3 and 7 to disambiguate and clarify. Bullet 3 asks that "requirements allocated to the items of the system" be traceable. However, requirements may not be allocated to system elements until after the		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
				architectural design phase. Suggest moving bullet 3 to F1.3.3.			
W10-15	TL	F1.3.2		Add consideration of prioritization of requirements as an outcome.		A	
W10-16	TL	F1.3.3 purpose		Allocation of requirements to releases is not considered in the process outcomes.		A	
W10-17	TL	F1.3.3 bullet 2		Replace "satisfied" with "addressed"		A	
W10-18	TL	F1.3.3 bullet 2		Replace "performance requirements" with "non-functional requirements". Also consider under System Requirements Analysis.		A	
W10-19	TL	F1.3.3 bullet 5		Replace with "verification between the system architecture and the system requirements is performed"		A	
W10-20	TL	F1.3.4 bullet 1		Definition of software requirements is missing. Replace outcome 1 with: "The requirements allocated to the software components of the system and their interfaces are defined"		A	
W10-21	TL	F1.3.4 bullet 4		Replace outcome 4 with "Consistency and traceability are established between the software requirements and the system requirements baseline".		A	
W10-22	TL	F1.3.4 bullet 7		Replace Bullet 7 with "The prioritization for implementing the software requirements is defined."		A	
W10-23	TL	F1.3.5 bullet 3		Delete "verified" as it has connotations of Level 2 capability.		A	
W10-24	TL	F1.3.5 bullet 4		Replace "consistency" with "consistency and traceability"		A	
W10-25	TL	F1.3.6 Purpose		Delete "and to verify" so that the purpose reads "that properly reflect the software		R	Conflicts with FRA-25
W10-26	TL	F1.3.6 bullet 3		Add "and traceability" after "consistency"		A	
W10-27	TL	F1.3.7 Purpose		Replace "and to verify the performance and functionality of the software on an equivalent or complete operational platform" with "that are demonstrated to meet the functional and non-functional requirements of the software on an equivalent or complete operational		A	
W10-28	TL	F1.3.7 bullet 1		Replace "release strategy" with "priorities of the software requirements"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
W10-29	TL	F1.3.7 bullet 6		Replace "consistency" with "consistency and traceability is established between software architectural design and..."		A	
W10-30	TL	F1.3.7 bullets 7 & 8		Combine outcomes 7 & 8 to read "A regression strategy is developed and applied..."		A	
W10-31	TL	F1.3.8 bullet 1		Delete "acceptance"		A	
W10-32	TL	F1.3.8		Add a new outcome based on the first outcome from TR15504-2 "Criteria for the integrated software will be developed that demonstrate criteria with the software requirements"		A	
W10-33	TL	F1.3.9 purpose		Delete "software items and to integrate the software with" with "other system elements, including other software items"		A	
W10-34	TL	F1.3.9 bullet 1		Replace "release strategy" with "priorities of the system requirements"		A	
W10-35	TL	F1.3.9 bullet 2		Delete "acceptance"		A	
W10-36	TL	F1.3.9 bullet 5		Delete "and validation that a complete set of useable deliverable components exists"		A	
W10-37	TL	F1.3.9 bullet 5		Replace "system requirements" with "System Architectural design"		A	
W10-38	TL	F1.3.9 bullet 2		Include a reference to system interfaces in outcome 2. Replace "aggregate" with "aggregate and interfaces between system elements"		A	
W10-39	TL	F1.3.10 bullet 1		Remove "acceptance"		A	
W10-40	TL	F1.3.10 bullet 1		Add a rephrased outcome based on the first outcome from TR15504-2 "Criteria for the integrated software will be developed that demonstrate criteria with the software requirements"		A	
W10-41	TL	F1.3.11 bullet 3		Replace with outcomes covering the development of installation test criteria and verification against these. Delete reference to "assurance"		AIP	Outcome 3 rephrased
W10-42	TL	F1.4 bullet 1		Replace "evaluated" with "identified and evaluated"		A	
W10-43	TL	F1.4.1		Replace with outcomes covering the development of installation test criteria and		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
				verification against these. Delete reference to "assurance"			
W10-44	TL	F1.4.2 Purpose		Replace first sentence with: "The purpose of Customer Support is to establish and maintain an acceptable level of service to the customer through assistance and consultation to support the effective use of the product" and delete the second sentence.		A	
W10-45	TL	F1.4.2 bullet 3		Reverse the order of the phrases to read "customer enquiries and requests and handling operational problems"		A	
W10-46	TL	F1.4.2 bullet 4		Rephrase "Customer needs" to "Customer Support needs"		A	
W10-47	TL	F1.5 Purpose		Replace first sentence with: "The purpose of the System and Software maintenance process is to modify a system or component after delivery to correct faults, improve performance or other attributes, or adapt to a changed environment"		A	
W10-48	TL	F1.5 bullet 2		Replace "is defined" with "are identified"		A	
W10-49	TL	F1.5 bullet 3		Replace whole bullet with "Affected documentation is updated as need"		A	
W10-50	TL	F1.5 bullet 7		Replace "software" with "software or"		A	
W10-51	TL	F2.1 bullet 5		Remove "for viewing"		A	
W10-52	TL	F2.1 bullet 6		Replace "specified" with "defined"		A	
W10-53	TL	F2.2 bullet 4		Change to "Modifications and releases of the items are made available to concerned parties"		A	
W10-54	TL	F2.3 bullet 3		Replace "identified" with "identified and recorded"		A	
W10-55	TL	F2.4 bullet 4		Rephrase to "defects are identified and recorded"		A	
W10-56	TL	F2.5 bullet 4		Rephrase to "Problems are identified and recorded"		A	
W10-57	TL	F2.6 purpose		Change "with the customer" to "with the stakeholders"		A	
W10-58	TL	F2.6 bullet 1		Rephrase to "Reviews are held at defined milestones and when deemed necessary"		A	
W10-59	TL	F2.6 bullet 5		Replace "resolved" with "reported"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
W10-60	TL	F2.7 bullet 2		Delete outcome (redundant, see bullet 4)		A	
W10-61	TL	F2.7 bullet 4		Replace "arranged" with "performed"		A	
W10-62	TL	F2.7 bullet 5		Delete "and resolved"		A	
W10-63	TL	F2.8 bullet 1		Replace outcome with "A problem resolution strategy is developed and implemented to ensure that all discovered problems are analysed and resolved"		A	
W10-64	TL	F2.9 purpose		Replace "individuals and/or groups that will work with the system" with "stakeholders"		A	
W10-65	TL	F2.10 bullet 3		Replace "specified" with "defined"		A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
ZAF-1	E	1.1.2		Add 'the' before software lifecycle	Replace 'The Configuration Management Process is a process of applying administrative and technical procedures to support the software life cycle to:' with 'The Configuration Management Process is a process of applying administrative and technical procedures to support the software life cycle to:'	A	
ZAF-2	E	D.2		Reference correction	Delete b)	A	
ZAF-3	E	D.3		Reference correction	Move a,b,c to D.2	A	
ZAF-4	TL	F.2.7		The audit process is a measurement process – not a problem fixing process. Issues raised in the Audit process are taken up the Problem Resolution process and resolved. (Note: F.3.1.6 Measurement process – does not mandate product or process improvement evidence before its outcomes are satisfied. Audit is a subset of the Measurement	Replace 'problems detected during an audit are identified, communicated to those responsible for corrective action, and resolved.' With 'problems detected during an audit are identified, communicated to those responsible for corrective action and resolution.'	A	
ZAF-5	E	F.3.1.5		The definitions and correct use of these elements is taken from 'Kaplan and Norton, The Strategy focused organisation'. Kaplan was responsible for the development of the widely used Balanced Scorecard Model.	Replace 'a vision, mission, goals and objectives for the business is made known to all employees; and' With 'a mission, core values, vision, goals and objectives for the business is made known to all employees; and'	A	
ZAF-6	TH	F.3.2.2		Assessment is a measurement activity. The results are neutral. The statement dealing with reviews is really part of the improvement process. A further major problem is that the outcomes of the assessment process cannot be satisfied until long after the assessment event, since the review of the continuing effectiveness of the organisations standard process might never take place. This happens when the assessment purpose is determination of capability e.g. when a software acquirer requires potential suppliers to show evidence of process capability. Since the assessed enterprise might have no interest in (or long-term commitment to) process improvement, the purpose of the assessment must remain unsatisfied. This is clearly an untenable and illogical outcome. (Note: F.3.1.6 Measurement process – does not mandate product or process improvement evidence before its outcomes are satisfied)	Delete 'reviews of the organization's standard processes are carried out at appropriate intervals to ensure their continuing suitability and effectiveness in light of assessment results.' (Move it to become the first outcome of F.3.2.3	A	
ZAF-7	TL	F.3.2.3		All the other outcomes of F.3.2.3 depend on the reviews taking place. The second and	Insert "reviews of the organization's standard processes are carried out at appropriate	A	

ID	Cat	Clause	Para	Comment and rationale	Proposed text	Out	Disposition
				subsequent outcomes are then plausible.	intervals to ensure their continuing suitability and effectiveness in light of assessment results.' From F.3.2.2 Note: This must be the first outcome of the process.		
ZAF-8	TL	F.3.2.3		Remove this outcome once ZAF 7 has been included in the list of outcomes since it is now redundant.	Delete 'the organization will effect improvements to its processes through activities such as process assessment and review;'	A	
ZAF-9	TH	F3.5		Remove Asset Management Process – not unique – all CM activities apply. Examine the activities and tasks under 7.5.1.1. If the term 'software item' is substituted in each place where 'asset' is used we have a description of the CM process.	We are unconvinced that the Asset Management Process is anything more than a CM process with 'Asset' substituted for CM. Note also that in the purpose statement 'The purpose of the Asset management process is to manage the life of reusable assets from conception to retirement' the emphasis is on reusable assets. In view of this there is heavy overlap with the Reuse Management process. Furthermore, there is no definition of the term 'asset' to see the differences between the use of the term 'asset' and say 'software item'.	AIP	The consistency between the 3.5 Purpose and Outcomes and the Annex G, 7.5 Asset Management Process will be improved.
ZAF-10	TH	F.3.7		Until the use of the term 'domain' is defined, this process will add no value in this standard. We could quite happily use the term 'blob' in place of 'domain' and we would be none the wiser as to what domain engineering is supposed to deal with.	The term 'domain' is undefined'. In view of the this the Domain Management process is so general as to not offer distinct value	AIP	The definition of Domain Engineering will be included from IEEE 1517:1999
ZAF-11	E	H.5.1.10.2		Financial records are not kept for audit purposes only. As in other areas of management, records are essential to preserve enterprise or project knowledge and experience.	Replace 'c) Records will be maintained to satisfy financial audits;' with 'c) Records will be maintained;'	A	
ZAF-12	E	H.5.1.10.2		Remove unnecessary words.	Replace 'Decisions will be taken to ensure financial objectives are met by the responsible personnel.' With ''Decisions will be taken to ensure financial objectives are met.'	A	